DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 042 142 AL 002 486

AUTHOR	Givens, Meredith B.
TITLE	Human Resources Development and Manpower Utilization in Afghanistan.
INSTITUTION	Agency for International Development (Dept. of State), Washington, D.C.
PUB DATE	May 67
NOTE	71p.
AVAILABLE FROM	Inspection copy available at the ERIC Clearinghouse for Linguistics, 1717 Massachusetts Ave., N.W., Washington, D.C. 20036
EDRS PRICE	EDRS Price MF-$0.50 HC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS	Agriculture, Cultural Factors, *Developing Nations, Education, *Human Resources, Literacy, *Manpower Utilization, *National Surveys, Universities, Working Women
IDENTIFIERS	*Afghanistan

ABSTRACT

This report, prepared by a labor economist and manpower specialist after about seven weeks of observation and consultation, aims to evaluate the extensive USAID (United States Agency for International Development) Mission education and training activities in relation to a realistic view of the current and future manpower needs in Afghanistan, and to determine what steps should be taken for this purpose. The introduction and list of specific proposals are followed by a general discussion of: (1) the Afghan setting; (2) the primacy of agriculture; (3) comments on the education system; (4) literacy and language; (5) middle level skills; (6) the Kabul University; (7) initiative and enterprise; (8) womanpower; (9) manpower planning; (10) a Human Resource Development program; (11) the labor market, occupations, and the wage structure. [Not available in hardcopy due to marginal legibility of original copy.] (AMM)

ED042142

F-AID
AL

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND MANPOWER UTILIZATION IN AFGHANISTAN

A Report Submitted to USAID/Kabul by

Meredith B. Givens

Chief, Manpower and Human Resources Branch
Education and Human Resources Division (PPC/TA - AID/W)

AL 002 486

May 1967

Kabul

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND MANPOWER UTILIZATION IN AFGHANISTAN

Outline

		Page
Part One:	Introductory	1
Part Two:	Specific Proposals	5
Part Three:	General Discussion	
	I. The Afghan Setting	10
	II. The Primacy of Agriculture	13
	III. Comments on the Education System	15
	IV. Literacy and Language	22
	V. Middle Level Skills	24
	VI. The Kabul University	29
	VII. Initiative and Enterprise	39
	VIII. Womanpower	44
	IX. Manpower Planning	46
	X. A Human Resources Development Program	55
	XI. The Labor Market, Occupations, and the Wage Structure	65

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND MANPOWER UTILIZATION IN AFGHANISTAN

A Report Submitted to USAID/Kabul by
Meredith B. Givens
Chief, Manpower and Human Resources Branch
Education and Manpower Planning Service (TCR/EMPS - AID/W)

PART ONE: INTRODUCTORY

This report is prepared by a TDY labor economist and manpower specialist detailed from AID/Washington, following about seven weeks of observation and consultation. It stems from the desire of the USAID Mission to evaluate its extensive education and training activities in relation to a realistic view of the current and future manpower needs in the country, and to determine what steps should be taken for this purpose.

AID advisors and contract personnel have been extensively contacted. Asia Foundation and United Nations/ILO/UNESCO advisors and various Afghan officials and others have been consulted. The University, schools at various levels, factories, farms and government offices have been visited in the Kabul area, Mazar-i-Sharif, Bost, Kandahar and Jalalabad. Government documents and advisory reports have been read and evaluated, and relevant literature and memoranda have been utilized as extensively as possible.

Terms of Reference: In February 1966, in a headquarters review of the education program in Afghanistan, Mr. McClure, the Mission Director, emphasized the critical deficiency of trained manpower in the country. In response, Mr. Bell, then AID Administrator, stated that education cannot be considered as a separate entity but should be structured to reflect the evolving patterns of manpower needs. Suggesting that education programs are carried out without adequate knowledge of requirements, he indicated that quantitative measures should be developed to guide future education plans and that capability for such analysis should be built into the structure of the RGA.

The writer of this report has undertaken to look at these needs and possibilities against the background of experience elsewhere and the present "state of the art", and to suggest relevant and practicable lines of approach by the Mission, including both specific recommendations and general observations on the manpower/human resources aspects of AID's activities in relation to the Afghan development program and prospects.

The problems of manpower development and utilization cover a broad area; in fact, they are dimensions of all aspects of the entire development process. In considering this field even short-term observations must range widely, and consequently some views and reactions are more firmly based than others. In the broad sense, however, the manpower problems of Afghanistan are almost glaringly obvious. The main steps that would need to be taken to establish a firmly committed program for human resource development and utilization are equally clear.

The pattern of foreign participation in technical assistance in Afghanistan is extremely complex, however. In consequence there are various questions of policy and priorities as well as specific proposals which may be controversial. No effort is made to avoid such questions or to hold back in emphasis or specific proposals which seem important. All observations and conclusions are offered with awareness of the greater depth of experience and insights of many persons with long background in the country, and with appreciation to those whose advice and counsel have been provided during the course of this assignment.

Basic Premises: It is a basic proposition in this report that an integrated program for human resources development and manpower utilization will link the planning of the educational system with over-all planning for manpower development and actual employment. A program for manpower is an essential element in over-all development planning.

5-17-67

The program formulated should take full account of the skill-generating value of work experience and work-related training, both formal and informal, in combination with formal schooling pertinent to the essential sectors of development. It will recognize that investment in education and training needs to find primary justification in the attainment of suitable and productive employment of members of a trained work force. NESA's presentation to Congress specifies that "technical assistance helps people ... (to) learn the skills and develop the institutions to use more effectively their own resources." This is the objective of teaching and learning in the development setting; when it fails of realization the cultural and civic values of education may be negated and lost.

Economists and developers sometimes are concerned mainly that shortages of technical skills do not become a bottleneck to growth. But solution of the manpower problem is equally related to the quality of education and training, both formal and informal, and proper attitudes toward work, and the efficient allocation of labor. The value of investment in manpower depends both the nature of the input and its efficient employment in the nation's development. A program for manpower utilization must give first attention, then, to relevance, content and quality in education and training and to the means whereby trained personnel will be properly distributed and utilized in suitable employment.

Education planning and manpower planning have been conceived separately and too narrowly in the past. Education planners are required to consider the division of resources among the competing claims at the several layers of formal education, and between formal schooling, training programs and the more informal processes of education. Planning models as adjuncts of budgets must take account of quality, extensions of coverage, and orientation

of content as well as costs. Methodology in education planning is partly demographic (projections of school populations), partly actuarial (taking account of growth rates, dropout rates and the like), and partly qualitative (pupil-teacher ratios, etc.).

Manpower assessments have been typically concerned with estimates of the quantities and occupational characteristics of the existing and needed supply of skilled persons in relation to specified rates of growth and patterns of development over the planning periods.

Both approaches have flaws: education plans are likely to be more or less abstract and self-contained within a schematic approach to educational institution building as such. Manpower planning has been chiefly dependent upon rather general census data and on employer surveys which provide a factual floor for projections, but often become unrealistic in their views of the future. They have also used analogies between developed and undeveloped countries, and have employed fixed-coefficient formulas which overlook qualitative factors of technology, productivity, managerial skill and the intensity of labor, and hence may become progressively unrealistic when economic environments are seriously underdeveloped.

The two approaches need to be linked together conceptually and operationally, first taking account of the qualitative relevance of education and training to existing occupational needs and requirements, and considering carefully the institutional arrangements and prospects for efficient distribution and utilization as well as the more or less hazardous projection of quantities. Education and manpower planning should be linked administratively both in the operations of host governments and in the organization of our AID Missions. This linkage is beginning to appear, notably in several Latin American Missions where the disciplines of education specialists and economists are brought together in guiding the programs for human resources.

5-17-67

PART TWO: SPECIFIC PROPOSALS
(For detailed discussion see Part Three)

(1) USAID should acquire the services of a high level and experienced manpower generalist labor economist, on a direct hire basis, to serve as a general resource person for the Mission and to carry out the following functions:

(a) Develop and maintain an overview of the broad aspects of human resources development and utilization in Afghanistan in relation to national goals and AID objectives.

(b) Maintain a critical scrutiny of the manpower aspects of all Mission programs.

(c) Consult with Government departments and officials, in cooperation with ILO and other advisors, with reference to the specifications, organization and composition of an effective national program for human resources development and utilization.

(d) Based on the recommendations of the short-term consultant, advise and assist the RGA in establishing and organizing a national manpower development agency, defining its scope of work and criteria for personnel selection and suggested placement. Creation of such a board is under consideration by the Cabinet and was recently urged by UNESCO.

(e) Advise and assist in setting up necessary data-gathering and auxiliary services as may be located outside the manpower agency.

(f) Conduct, when appropriate arrangements can be made, a seminar on human resources and national development for faculty participation at the University of Kabul, and upon invitation to plan and arrange for a senior university course and a field work research program on labor market problems, occupations and employment.

(g) Seek facilities for and develop under appropriate auspices research projects relating to the labor market, wages and incentives, work histories and performance of employed personnel in selected occupational fields.

(h) Conduct on-the-job training of Afghan personnel as needed and plan appropriate participant study in U.S. and/or third country.

(i) As far as practicable with available data, prepare working estimates of manpower requirements in major or key technical, industrial, agricultural and other occupational categories.

(j) In consultation with Division Chiefs, offer specific proposals for Mission programs and action within the context of these and related duties and assist in formulation of recommendations for educational and human resources planning, including changes of policy and needed level of investment.

(2) USAID at this time should not undertake or support a large scale manpower survey. The RGA is not yet prepared for a comprehensive

project, and such an effort under present circumstances would be abortive and unproductive. When more adequate institutional capability for data production, analysis and coordinated action in the human resources/manpower field should be established in the Afghan Government, with a commitment to an adequate staff, USAID might consider appropriate backstopping. Meanwhile practical steps should be initiated to develop needed personnel and institutional arrangements.

(3) An explicit and high level authority should be established within the Government to assume responsibility for a broad program for human resources development planning, the efficient allocation of trained manpower to meet development needs, promotion of effective utilization and coordination of manpower programs on a government-wide basis. A national manpower development board to be broadly representative of ministries and major agencies should be made responsible directly to the Prime Minister and supported with adequate staff. Its members should have ministerial authority to coordinate programs and activities within their own jurisdictions in harmony with overall plans. Such a board has been proposed by UNESCO and is under consideration by the Cabinet. If and when such a body is established, invested with meaningful authority and equipped with the needed staff, USAID should explore the feasibility of expanded technical assistance.

(4) The national manpower development board should set up facilities to deal with high level manpower problems and to create and maintain a comprehensive inventory and register of highly trained personnel. It should coordinate middle-level supervisory and craft training programs and develop a broad program for work-based training. It should develop programs for employing surplus or redundant manpower.

(5) The technical staff for human resources and manpower planning should not be subsumed under a statistical section in the Ministry of Planning as at present. A manpower program must go far beyond statistics. It will be concerned with the initiation and coordination of on-going manpower activities on an inter-agency basis. It should define the requirements for manpower statistics in cooperation with the statistical office of the Ministry of Planning, and should utilize the services of that office in combination with those of other Ministries and agencies under a coordinated scheme for statistical development.

(6) For the future USAID should consider expanding its Education Division to constitute a Human Resources Development Division. This has been done in several Missions. Such a Division would include an Education Section and a Manpower Section, and would be headed by a Chief whose duties, regardless of his own discipline, would be interdisciplinary in nature. The participant training program might logically be brought within this framework.

5-17-67

(7) The Statistics Division of the Ministry of Planning should be made responsible for the planning and development of a comprehensive and coordinated system of government statistics in Afghanistan. Required manpower and labor statistics should be developed in direct association with other types of data needed for planning and administration. Regular collection of data from governmental and private establishments, often as a byproduct of administrative and accounting operations, will be a part of this system, in parallel with collection of information from the population through census and sample surveys. Standard classifications, methods and procedures for this purpose are well developed and available from the United Nations Statistical Office. Upon request either the UN or the U.S. should provide services of an advisor in this field. Training in statistical development and methodology should be provided preferably through a University-based program for both in-service and academic training as in the Philippine model.

(8) Improved productivity of agriculture through technical support, education, and motivation of farmers is the manpower problem of first magnitude. Increased emphasis should be given to training personnel for technical work and research in agriculture and for effective communication with farmers. More trained manpower should be directed into rural education and rural development efforts.

(9) Improved administrative management is a critical need. Every opportunity and available device should be used to promote and foster it. The proposed Afghan Management Improvement Institute, if established, should be supported in the development and promotion of improved management methods and training with application to agricultural, industrial and business management as well as to public administration.

(10) The near monopoly of government in the affairs of the society produces a general weakness of incentives, initiative, and innovation. Possibly the most creative approach to stimulation of enterprise might be to launch full scale demonstrations of successful and profitable operations under American private management, with the intention of transfer to indigenous private operation after demonstration is complete and convincing. A major project in the development and management of a large tract of suitable agricultural land, bringing it to a high level of productivity according to American standards, might be a dramatic possibility.

(11) The education system should be coordinated and focussed more sharply at all levels toward the goals of national development. Unless prepared vocationally for productive employment educated persons do not contribute to society.

5-17-67

(12) Direct linkage of formal education with work-based training should be a first objective in middle level skills development. Preparation for employment should stress the acquisition of basic skills and occupational flexibility, in combination with the disciplines of organized work experience. Employing institutions with capacity to produce experienced and efficient people should be identified, and pressure should be put on such establishments to assume greater responsibilities for on-the-job training as an integral part of an expanded approach to education for work.

(13) Over-investment at successive stages or in particular segments of education should be avoided. Terminal programs at intermediate levels, and appropriate rewards for school leavers at these levels, have a special importance. Special efforts should be made to utilize dropouts who have consumed costly educational inputs, and to conserve and develop them as productive members of the labor force. An educational pyramid is far preferable to an hourglass in the layering of the educational system.

(14) A development focus in education must be animated from the top. The following suggestions pertain to the key role of the Kabul University as a major force in manpower development for national goals.

(a) The Faculty of Agriculture should be structured to include rural development as a technical field and the curriculum in home economics should be transferred to this Faculty.

(b) A program of university education in Industrial and Business Management should be introduced, probably by the Faculty of Economics in cooperation with Engineering, with possible support by an additional university contract if necessary.

(c) The curricula of Faculties of Letters, Science and Education should be closely interrelated in order to provide for a unified approach to a curriculum of general studies and professional preparation for teaching to these combined faculties.

(d) Additional support should be given to the development of the University as an internally coordinated entity flexibly adaptable to the expanding and changing national needs for educated manpower. The new campus and the assistance now given to central administration are unifying forces but the complexities of multi-national affiliations tend toward fragmentation. To contribute more sharply toward closer integration USAID may consider advantages of establishing a

5-17-67

unified consortium of university teams, to simplify AID's relationship to the on-going effort, furnish further coordination and enhance the total U.S. contribution toward a more effective institution.

(15) Continuing education and selective upgrading of the labor force is a neglected potential in the national education system. Urgent shortages are met more rapidly and efficiently by this method than by training new people. This emphasis contributes new incentives and promotes a healthy upward mobility in the work force.

(16) Manpower estimates to guide university programs will be differently based for different fields. To derive national requirements for teacher training and for health workers is less complicated than for tother occupations, as these will be controlled directly by the scale and firmness of government plans and budgets. Surveys and appraisals of needs may help in setting targets for development, but needs are not equivalent to absorptive capability. Actual utilization will be determined by allocations which are explicit or reliably assured in government financing. The Minister of Education recently stated that 1930 more teachers are needed today, and that need will reach nearly 8,000 during the Third Five Year Plan. When such targets are broken down by educational levels and matched by budgetary provisions they of necessity provide the guidance for educational output.

(17) The situation is different in the case of engineering. The major institutions and establishments that employ or can employ engineers are limited in number, known or ascertainable. It is suggested that the Faculty of Engineering itself conduct an inquiry among principal users and potential users of engineers, by personal contact with the establishments as far as possible. This will provide insights for both inquirers and respondents, furnish precise information on specifications as well as numbers of potential openings, develop a realistic view of the prospects for expansion of these enterprises, and open up opportunities for in-service work or on-the-job training and possibilities for continuing education for technical workers already employed. It may be advisable to employ a special member of the Faculty to assume responsibilities for this work.

(18) The Faculty of Agriculture may consider a procedure similar to that suggested for engineering as a device for opening up new fields for its graduates.

(19) A distorted wage and salary structure obstructs the efficient allocation of manpower and motivation for full endeavor. Suggestions for research on occupations and the wage structure are offered in the body of this report.

PART THREE: GENERAL DISCUSSION

I. The Afghan Setting

Afghanistan, by fundamental law and official pronouncement, is dedicated to progressive democracy, basic reforms, a struggle for progress and prosperity, and an "organized effort to utilize material and human resources." in the pursuit of welfare goals. Tangible progress is visible, but these resources remain seriously undeveloped and underutilized according to almost any standard.

Without doubt, the physical resources of Afghanistan, when further developed and properly managed, are able to support rising levels of production, productivity and human welfare. The dynamic for this effort, however, can only be supplied by effectively organized and directed human motivation, skills, and energy. Unless necessary skills are generated and creatively utilized in productive employment, the nation's goals and aspirations will be elusive and unfulfilled.

Up to the present Afghanistan, by its very backwardness, has been spared some of the cumulating ills now afflicting large areas of the developing world. With its estimated 15-16 millions of inhabitants it is not yet over-populated, and the current pace of the health program has not produced visible evidence of an alarming rate of population growth, though statistical data are lacking. The country is poor and primitive, but the abject poverty of India is not found here. The chronic and painfully visible unemployment which plagues the cities of the Indo-Pakistan subcontinent does not seem to exist as yet, though the traditional technology of agriculture and sluggishness in the intensity of rural labor compounded by recurring seasonal slackness are sources of hidden unemployment and underemployment. Immigration into the cities is not yet excessive though it is accelerating: the problem thus far

is not so much one of the blocking this movement but rather the task of preventing it by improving the prospects for agriculture and rural living.

A special characteristic of this land (shared with a small number of other land-locked nations) is that the changes and pangs of modernization are impending rather than extensively experienced at the present time. But the respite is temporary. The new forces are pushing into the country's rural life as well as in the bigger towns and cities, and will challenge the planning and programming of the next decade. The countryside is being sliced by new paved roads and feeder roads, and their narrow ribbonlike impacts, motorized transport, and the spillover of new activities to feed and support the new traffic. Though cash crops do not yet produce much money income for most farmers, this change is accelerating the spread of schools, whatever their limitations, and it stimulating curiosity and a sense of the wider world.

The extensive construction projects, north and south, generate new activities, new employments (though some are temporary) and new skills, Compulsory military service of two years is making inroads into provincial localism at least among the youth who serve. When health services reduce death rates--especially infant mortality rates--population pressures in rural life will increase. Unless education becomes more functional rather than status-oriented and escapist, the familiar phenomenon of the educated urban unemployed will appear with the concomitant dangers of social and political disturbance.

Predominating impressions of development effort and government activity in general are those of fragmentation, bureaucratic isolationism, a prevailing obstruction of channels of communications among agencies whose activities require coordination, and underdeveloped institutions (both public and private).

5-17-67

This is evident in the absence of cooperation and mutual support among agencies importantly concerned with manpower. The government sets goals and establishes plans for various sectors of activity in more or less separate compartments. The Ministry of Education has undertaken to initiate a vocational guidance program, but the effort is conducted without informational support from major employing agencies such as the Ministry of Mines and Industries, the Ministry of Commerce, etc. There is no operating relationship between the rural development program (Ministry of Interior), and the community schools (Ministry of Education), though there are important common elements in these programs. Ministries apparently dislike supplying information to each other, and machinery for authoritative coordination and clearance is lacking. These shortcomings stand in the way of effective manpower utilization as well as other needs of development.

A further impression is that of a prevailing administrative inexperience and immaturity. Qyite typically investment in physical facilities can proceed and desired targets are set without a clear definition of organization and management required to carry out intentions, which results, among other things, in overburdened top officials and underemployed subordinates. This is a manpower problem of the first importance, creating a serious waste of resources, and calling for a major educational effort in management training. Afghan workers at middle and lower levels are thoroughly capable of taking responsibility, and their effective utilization is a question of good management.

II. The Primacy of Agriculture.

There is no disagreement that Afghanistan is an agricultural country and will remain so for the predictable future. Eighty-five per cent of its population is rural. Its industrial sector is mainly dependent upon agricultural production for its raw materials, and upon agricultural incomes for any prospects for mass markets. Investment in infrastructure has been chiefly focussed on agricultural needs for water, roads to markets, transport and communication. Much less attention is given to farmers themselves.

Any widespread improvement in levels of welfare in all sectors must be based predominantly on improvements in farmers' productivity, and in the means and methods of rural living -- sanitation and health, better nutrition, more functional education in rural schools, more efficient self-help in domestic production of daily requirements and amenities, and the like. Elevation of rural living standards and farm incomes must be the main foundation for growth of consumer purchasing power.

That a top priority must be assigned to the manpower needs of agricultural development seems an obvious and inescapable conclusion. Priority for agriculture has been sharply defined by AID in its current emphasis on a "war on hunger." For the NESA region it is specifically stated that present policies and programs are to help "release the energies of rural peoples" and make possible sharply increased use of fertilizers, improved seed varieties, better cultivation, improved tools and equipment, market facilities, credit programs, and other needed supporting services for agriculture. To move with any expedition toward these objectives will require a large scale effort to produce trained manpower for research and development in agriculture and related fields, and especially for effective and informed communication and motivation among the farmers and in the rural communities.

5-17-67

In the First and Second Five Year Plans agricultural development was assigned third place, junior to the investments in transportation, communication and electric power. Within agriculture itself primary importance has been assigned to water and soil surveys, irrigation projects, and efforts toward expansion of land areas available for cultivation. It seems likely, however, that the greatest potential for improved productivity and greater output must be found in the education and motivation of farmers on land now under cultivation to accept and utilize better farming practices, and in development of agricultural specialists to undertake skilled planning and provision of better services for farmers. These currently are the key manpower problems of agriculture, and the most crucial for the country's development today and for the next two or more Plan Periods. Agricultural development is not yet receiving the emphasis it needs in the nation's educational system.

It will be necessary to elevate the image of agriculture in Afghanistan to its appropriate place in order to induce trained individuals with ability to provide the needed leadership. It will be imperative to convince the people of the potentials of agricultural improvement. An important share of this task will fall on Afghanistan's schools. The entire population needs to be informed about the meaning of agricultural development for their everyday lives and their country's future.

In summary, the development effort in Afghanistan cannot proceed except on the basis of an improving agriculture. Only rising mass markets based on the villages can provide the basis for a growing manufacture. To train, motivate and utilize a growing supply of qualified persons who can foster agricultural improvement and stimulate rural development is the knottiest and most crucial manpower problem of the country.

5-17-67

III. Comments on the Education System

In these notes on education no attempt is made to describe the system asa whole. This is well documented elsewhere by UNESCO and by the Mission.

Education is the nation's fastest growing industry. According to estimates employment in education has increased by more than 75% during the Second Plan period, and is expected to double during the Third Plan. The number of village, primary and intermediate schools nearly doubled during the Second Plan, numbering more than 2,400. The number of pupils in the primary and village schools has been reported at a figure slightly over 400,000, which is still only about 13 per cent of the children at school ages from 7 to 15. Students in vocational schools also increased in numbers, which, however, were relatively small -- and at a lesser rate from a reported 9280 to 12,700, predominantly in teacher training to meet the requirements of primary and village schools. The number of university students increased from 1950 to 3,300 during the Second Plan Period.

The educational system is heavily dependent on foreign aid. The scale of international assistance in support of education in Afghanistan is impressive in absolute terms, and massive in relation to the size of the country. This assistance is bargained for from all quarters; there is little indigenous effort to build the scattered sources into an undistorted system.

International assistance to education is provided by the U.S. in amounts larger than for any other country, by the USSR on a similarly large scale; by the United Nations system; and in lesser amounts by Germany, France and a few other countries. It is appropriate also to

classify other categories of technical assistance intrinsically as education ... e.g., public administration, planning, specialized fields such as cadastral survey, etc... since all such activities engage in the development and transfer of knowledge and skills, identification of human capabilities, arousing and guidance of motivations, stimulation of initiative, creativity and demonstration of the values and potentials of constructive change.

Investments in human resources and in real or financial assets are interdependent variables. They should not be regarded as competing investments. The value of outlay in one may fall toward zero if investment is not made in the other. Investment in the ingredients for better agriculture, such as irrigation projects, fertilizer production, better seeds and machinery, for example -- may be lost if parallel investment is not made in agricultural expertise and the human means of demonstration and communication to farmers. The problem is thus one of proportioning rather than choice of alternatives.

It is doubtful if Afghanistan's planners can or will, under present circumstances, achieve an allocation of resources for the education sector with precision which is related at all accurately to a balanced system of priorities in a general program for development, or within education itself. The capability and the basic facts for this purpose simply do not exist. Nor can a division of emphasis be made with discernment between formal schooling and the more informal processes of skill generation. The need is to combine these approaches at as many points as possible in an integrated program.

In practice the investments in education are determined by a combination of institutional, political and economic factors. Since the productivity

of these investments cannot be calculated very usefully inarithmetic terms at this stage, the course to follow is to match the investments which can be afforded with commensurate care in directing expenditures to assure a high level of utilization and to minimize wastage.

This objective requires extension of the concept of education beyond the formal structure into employment-oriented areas such as on-the-job training and apprenticeship, skill-generating work experience, and participation in various job-related activities of institutions which are occupationally-focusses, such as professional and scientific associations, business and management groups, trade and labor organizations. This latter group of activities scarcely exist in Afghanistan, but they have great potentialities when they can develop. These various mutually reinforcing processes of human resource development utilize and interrelate the several stages of education, including adult and continuing education, stimulate an understanding of occupations and occupational opportunities, and open many avenues into the world of work.

In the broadest sense the processes of education serve two large aims - social and cultural development, and the preparation of manpower required for economic progress. These objectives are not in conflict; they supplement each other. But the latter purpose must be served if the former is to be realized. Educated unemployed, underemployed and misfits do not contribute to society.

Since education alone does not create jobs, and by itself it does not insure capable, imaginative participation in the labor force, over-education can be a serious form of waste. It is important to avoid overinvestment in particular segments of education.

5-17-67

A disturbing sign of overinvestment appears when unemployment or downgraded levels of employment appear among educated persons. It is reported that this begins to show among graduates of the Faculties of Science and Letters, for example, at the University of Kabul. This should be watched in every field, and procedures for this purpose will be suggested. Whether restriction of educational output or qualitative changes in content should be the remedy is a matter for analysis; if no better alternative remedy is practicable or accessible, then restriction of numbers in such situations may be wise. In a field where the problem is not one of qualitative relevance to job opportunities and requirements, the remedy may be found in an active program of promotion to extend the fields of employment for graduates.

The salvage of wasted training is as important and may be more important in the long run than the production of new trained persons. Overtraining should be avoided, and special attention should be paid to utilization of those whose education is terminated in the middle levels. Dropouts should be converted into assets; in many cases they may be greater assets than if they were overtrained. This will require diagnosis of capabilities and knowledge of the job market. In principle the incipient program for vocational guidance should provide assistance in this respect, but thus far little job market information is supplied for its use. This problem will be referred to later.

Educational output can be markedly improved by reducing the number of repeaters who wastefully absorb teaching energy. A higher dropout rate may be preferable. A manpower pyramid is the goal rather than the hourglass now found in most developing countries.

5-17-67

Much educational effort can be wasteful when curricula and teaching are not specifically directed into meaningful contribution to the major objectives of development. This relevance of education to development goals can begin at primary levels, and should be accented at each stage in the upward progression through the educational pyramid if in turn it is to penetrate downward through improved teaching and curricula.

To introduce a dominating concept of relevance to development goals in the Afghan educational system will require a revolutionary effort, but the effort should be made. This functional approach collides with the rooted traditions of rote learning, and attacks the concepts of education as title to status, privilege, and a means of escape from the lot of less privileged and uneducated. (For purposes of investment planning the so-called "consumption values" of education should be treated as a by-product, although an important one.)

With rapid expansion sparked by the goal of universal primary education, a growing demand, and compulsory attendance where schools exist, it could not be expected that the quality of teaching at the lower levels can have improved during this period of growth. Most lower level teachers are only a few grades ahead of their pupils, and the system of rote drilling continues without insufficient concept of functional literacy and relevance to the occupational lives which lie ahead in predominantly rural environments.

In this situation the importance of curriculum revision with an imaginative focus on the goals of development can hardly be over-emphasized. To develop capability for problem solving through work

experience in combination with formal schooling must become a conscious aim of the educational system. It may be expected that the curriculum revision project now being undertaken for the lower schools will be animated by this objective without sacrifice of the essential cultural values of education.

A special feature of Afghan education is the financing of the students. Above the lower levels students are paid to go to school. Thus schooling is an economic boon and requires no specific cost or sacrifice. This seems both necessary and at the same time unfortunate. The support becomes largesse for the more affluent, as well necessary subsidy for poorer families the vast majority of whom could not afford costs of education beyond free lower grades. When students who fail a single course must repeat an entire year (this has been the practice at the University), this can result in a form of malingering and a wasteful burden on education facilities. To devise a needed combination of academic discipline with rewards and incentives under this system will not be easy.

The payment of students creates an investment by the government in the educational product, and this in turn leads to the allocation of the graduates of higher level institutions to jobs not necessarily of their choice. The only escape from these assignments is to refund to the government the costs of the education, an obvious impossibility for all but a very few. If wisely exercised with knowledge, insights, and without favoritism, this allocative power could be a tool to maximize suitable placements and good utilization of trained personnel, but there is no assurance that this will be the case. This subject is treated further in a later section of this memorandum.

5-17-67

A development approach to education must be animated from the top - from the University and teacher training levels - where the development leaders, planners, teachers of teachers, and trainers of trainers, are produced. This approach must have the active support of the government beyond the verbalization of national goals and the schematic programs of the successive Five Year Plans, and it must have the backing of each Ministry and agency which employes, utilizes, and directs manpower in development activities. This calls for a sharp break from the prevailing academic pattern with its image of formal educational attainment as a claim to status and would emphasize the instrumental value of education as a gateway to further learning and development through creative participation in the national life.

IV. Literacy and Language

Literacy is an important component of human resource development. The Prime Minister has pinpointed the matter: "For us in Afghanistan Education is in many ways the greatest need among the many needs of our country ... Only about six percent of our people are literate, and out of that small group have to come all our teachers, all our technicians, all our administrators, all our managers."

The establishment of literacy in the early years is a paramount function of the village and primary schools. Beginnings of literacy will rub off on adults in homes, villages and local communities. Unfortunately the spread of literacy is burdened by the commitment to bilingual instruction in Dari and in Pashtu at early ages. This multi-lingual load beginning in the primary schools gives undue emphasis to early rote memory and displaces subject matter learning. The two vernaculars have more than limited kinship, and over time the dual usage may slowly lead toward fusion in spite of regional separatism. A research program to explore the area of common ground would seem an attractive possibility, perhaps under the sponsorship of an institute for language study or at the University. Such an effort has been undertaken in other countries with similar problems.

Emphasis on functional literacy will contribute directly to manpower development goals and should be supported by the preparation of new textbooks and a varied flow of other attractive and useful materials. Experience with functional literacy programs in other countries should be appraised, including an examination of its applications in adult education.

5-17-67

That English has been firmly established as the second language is an important achievement. The same need for English materials functionally oriented to the needs of the country arises as in the case of the indigenous languages. As the most serviceable international language, English is a gateway to the wider world, a highway for ideas, and it is important that there should be an accelerating flow of traffic.

There is no doubt that the necessity for two vernacular languages slows the education process and deters the economic development of the country. A multiplicity of languages, indigenous and foreign interferes with efficient manpower development. As UNESCO has emphasized, a single first foreign language should be officially recognized. Since English has world-wide currency, it would be entirely feasible to require foreign teachers to know English in addition to their native language whether the latter should be French, German, or Russian.

5-17-67

V. Middle Level Skills

The Mission's recent review of education in Afghanistan stated that "greater effort will be made to utilize available opportunities for in-service training." Presumably this is meant to include work-based training

To promote development, and to achieve maximum efficiency in vocational training, it is important to identify the least expensive manpower levels capable of maintaining needed standards of quality. Engineers should not do the work of skilled craftsmen, though in their training they may have needed some craft experience. A distinction also should be made between the upper-middle levels of supervisors and leadmen who are "problem-solvers" and the skilled and semi-skilled craftsmen who lack this capability. The use of sub-professional personnel multiplies the productivity of higher skilled workers. This leads to emphasis on terminal education at intermediate levels, utilization of school leavers and the great importance of middle level personnel.

Middle level skills are generated in various ways. Basically, the process of training a person to do a job is fairly simple. People learn by doing. The key task is to establish the necessary arrangements and "climate" within which training can take place under practical operating conditions with necessary backstopping through formal schooling. Wherever the basic skills of going enterprise are well established a capability exists for further skill generation, and on-the-job training becomes a practicable procedure.

Development of human resources for the occupational world is accomplished through an over-all process which includes both structured and unstructured learning experiences. The line of distinction between education and training is a thin one. The twin systems reinforce each

other although their specific aims differ. Education is concerned with the acquisition of general knowledge and the development of basic abilities, whereas training involves the development of specific skills needed for particular tasks, using the technqies of telling, discussion, questioning, work performance under observation, observation of others, testing, experimentation and where suitable, visual aids. Work activity partakes of the nature of education; a new and closer relation between the two has become both necessary and possible.

In the development field there is now a general effort to find the best, quickest and most economical way to produce middle level skills. Alternative paths of training are being tested to determine which can produce the best trained men--what materials, human and physical are needed, and at what school levels the development of occupationally applicable skills can best begin. The recent Korry recommendations for Africa emphasized the importance of ways to produce middle level technicians with a better benefit/cost ratio than through conventional and expensive formal technical schools, and suggested that the U.S. should lead in finding such techniques by means of centers operated in close cooperation with business and industrial firms.

Assessment of resources for manpower training should include an appraisal of the capacity of major employing institutions to produce experienced and efficient people. Pressure should be put on employing establishments, both public and private, to assume responsibilities for

5-17-67

on-the-job training. Logically, the burden of craft training, supervisory training, and manager development should be borne by these establishments at their expense. In various Latin American countries an "apprentice tax" scheme provides that all enterprises shall pay a percentage of the cost of training [e.g., SENAI (Service National de Aprandizagem Industrial) in Brazil].

In the longer run training schemes should be supported by communities and professional associations as well as by the enterprises themselves. In the short run a subsidy may be necessary for establishments which train beyond their own requirements.

In the main, the manppwer development programs supported by AID have stressed work-based training such as apprenticeship-type schemes and trade schools, in the manufacturing and closely related occupational fields. Over-formal and excessively prolonged apprenticeship of course should be avoided. Such work-oriented systems may be applied to agriculturally-oriented activities, in distribution and transportation - in fact, in almost any field of work. UNESCO has recommended an approach for commercial occupations in Afghanistan whereby primary school leavers would "receive practical training in different commercial enterprises and attend courses at a vocational school or training center in a day-release or block release system."

By effecting a direct linkage of education with work-based training both employers and schools participate actively in a nnified education/training program demonstrating practicable work-connected alternatives for expensive expansion of trade schools which cannot be adequately spread throughout the country, and at the same time maximizing the

assurance of jobs for graduates. This approach to middle level manpower development is thoroughly vindicated in American experience. It is certain that it will be used in the USSR-sponsored programs, in the Technikums and also within industrial operations where Russian tools, techniques and instruction are applied.

Occupational training, wherever possible in coordination with productive work experience, should prepare for specific and existing jobs. New entrants in any occupational field, however, face working careers in a world of change in which the precise jobs of today will be upgraded, diluted, subdivided, combined, mechanized, or perhaps abolished in the trades and professions of tomorrow. Short-cut methds (usually on-the-job) can and should be used to create or upgrade specific skills where there are precise and immediate needs and job opportunities. But as the education and training process becomes extended and costly the need for flexibility and convertibility of skills gains in importance. In no country will the occupational requirements of today be those of tomorrow.

Programs for skills development should "work backward" from job requirements to the needed training. Elsewhere in this report (Part Three, XI) a research project is suggested which would seek to identify a group of key industrial occupations which are "skill-generative", comprising "job families" or clusters of related and interchangeable job components; study and job analysis within such occupational groups would produce useful background and guidance for vocational training programs.

5-17-67

These considerations are especially important in the training of new workers who look forward to decades of work experience in a changing and technologically advancing world. Adequate preparation should combine capacity to perform particular tasks with the ability to work with others, accept the disciplines of division of labor and subdivision of tasks, ability to follow instructions whether oral or written, and within the framework of instructions to act with needed independence and responsibility and respond with intelligence to the employment situation. While these things cannot be learned in school, neither are they acquired best without the inputs of formal schooling.

Sheer experience in working on a particular job with superiors and subordinates constitutes training on the job. Capacity for supervision or leadership also arises out of this experience. Demonstration of this capacity segregates the problem-solvers from the pure craftsman. The development of an adequate occupational education program within the educational system is a prerequisite to the development of occupational flexibility.

The considerations advanced above suggest the great importance of employment creation in the development effort. If education cannot create jobs, neither can skills be fully learned in the absence of opportunity for employment. Development and upgrading of skills within employment, of course, depends upon the existence of the employment. Employment creation, therefore, is the key to the expansion of a skilled labor force, and the dynamic positive purpose is supplied by private enterprise.

5-17-67

VI. The Kabul University

Kabul University is the key institution in high level manpower development in Afghanistan. Its sense of purpose and support of national goals will affect the entire educational process for the years ahead. It represents the primary and central area of U.S. educational investment in the country. Its focus on development aims is important in the implementation of U.S. policy.

Kabul University has been built on a European pattern which is prevalent among many Asian institutions - consisting of a loose collection of independent faculties which were physically separated until 1964. It has developed a complicated pattern of foreign relationships.

The University was started in 1932 with a Faculty of Medicine which, from its inception, has been affiliated with the French University of [redacted] Lyons. It now includes a curriculum in Pharmacy. The Faculty of Law and Political Science, established in 1938, included a Faculty of Economics until the latter became independent in 1957. The Faculty of Science was created in 1942, Letters in 1943, and Education in 1962-63. Law and Political Science has a French affiliation with the University of Paris; Economics is affiliated with Kaelen University and Science with the University of Bonn in West Germany. Faculties of Agriculture and of Engineering were established in 1956; Engineering was first joined with Science, then in 1958 with Agriculture, and became independent in 1963. A former Faculty for Women was abandoned when all faculties were opened

to women students. A short-lived independent Faculty of Home Economics is now a department of the Faculty of Education. The Faculties of Education, Engineering and Agriculture are backstopped by American universities under AID contracts. A new Polytechnic Institute, established with large scale Russian assistance and Russian teaching personnel, has been opened this year. (The Faculty of Theology, linked with Ael Aeshar University in the UAR, is outside the general scope of this report.)

The University is reaching for its mission in relation to the national aims defined in the new constitution, though as recently as February 1967 it summarized its academic role in traditional terms as a dedication "to the three universal functions of scholars; the preservation of knowledge; the dissemination of knowledge; the advancement of knowledge."

The pattern of the University's activities and the relative emphasis received by the different fields is indicated by the recent distribution of enrollment among the Faculties as reported in February, 1967. Excluding Medicine with its 608 students, Law and Political Science had the largest enrollment (476). These students together with the Faculty of Economics (294) account for 25% of total University enrollment; their graduates are directed almost entirely into diplomatic and administrative posts within the government.

The three Faculties of Letters (550), Science (350), and Education (385) comprise more than 40% of the student body; practically all of

their graduates become teachers. Engineering enrolls 355, and its graduates to date have been absorbed by the Faculty itself or largely by government enterprises. Agriculture, though concerned with the nation's dominant industry, enrolled only 130 students during the past term, less than 5% of the University's total (fewer than Theology with 150); its graduates numbered 157 last February, and are either retained by the Faculty or directed into the Ministry of Agriculture at headquarters, in extension or in past at provincial or other field stations. This year its intake of new students has been sharply increased to 180 freshmen as compared with 41 in the previous year, but the continuing rate of entry is expected to be between the two figures.

An essential step toward integration of the University was taken in 1964 with the opening of the central campus which is utilized by all Faculties (except by the new Polytechnic) and provides various combined facilities, notably a University library, dormitories, athletic facilities, and central administrative offices contiguous to these Faculties. Of more substantive significance is the new cooperative arrangement with Indiana University which is providing much needed advisory service in general university administration.

Kabul University graduates, it is generally conceded, are below international standards in attainment. Some opinions hold that their education is equivalent to no more than junior college or perhaps no more than top grade US high school level. This of course has nothing to do with innate capabilities of the Afghans. It is attributable to deficient foundation at preparatory levels, defective

teaching, rote learning, undeveloped capacity for cause-and-effect analysis and identification of choices and alternatives, and inadequate capacity for problem-solving. The result in effect amounts to education without training: the acquisition of information by memory without experience or practice to illuminate the uses of information and knowledge, and no concept that the true role of education is to open the gateway to lifetime learning.

Now with more than a decade as a diversified multi-Faculty institution, the University of Kabul shows only limited signs of interchange or integration among faculty offerings. There are beginning signs, however. Of special interest is the collaboration now beginning between the Faculties of Agriculture and Engineering in offering a degree in Agricultural Engineering. This should add prestige and drawing power for agriculture as a technical field. With the growing interest in mechanization, soils survey and analysis, and scientific control of fertilizer manufacture and utilization, as well as improved operation of smaller farms, the common ground between the chemical engineer, the mechanical engineer and the agricultural technician should bring these Faculties, which were previously joined, into renewed close contact. This is in line with the tradition of the American land grant colleges, probably the most development-oriented institutions in the university world. It is this tradition which is appearing in agricultural universities such as Lyallpur in Pakistan, at Los Baños in the Philippines and elsewhere, and which is fostered by Wyoming at Kabul especially through its scientific field research projects, which should be expanded.

5-17-67

Another sign of inter-Faculty relationships is the offering of a course in rural development by the same instructor in the Faculties of Education and of Agriculture. The place of rural development as a technical and occupational field deserves more emphasis in education and in government. Ironically, among the developing nations a confusion has been allowed to a rise between agricultural extension and rural "community development". As an international program community development has acquired an "uplift image" associated with social work and public welfare. In fostering improved practices and self help in rural communities it has come into collision with agricultural extension programs, and as a distinguishable activity it has virtually disappeared in AID programs, giving way to the incipient emphasis on "political development" and democratic institutions as defined objective in present U.S. foreign assistance legislation.

There is a focus a drive, and down-to-earth approach in rural development program which should be incorporated within the education and agricultural development effort. The rural development educational effort in Afghanistan is lodged in the Ministry of Interior which operates a Training Center near Kabul and works through the provincial machinery in some 42 development centers. Graduates of the Center at twelfth grade level become development workers in rural communities, thus accomplishing a "return to the bush" which is difficult to attain among the graduates of academic intermediate schools, or even among the graduates of agricultural schools the Faculty of Agriculture.

The plight of home economics and its constituent disciplines deserves comment. Its establishment as a separate Faculty was premature.

5-17-67

Two general courses are mandatory at present for juniors and seniors in the Faculty of Education, but the position of the curriculum in that Faculty is hazardous. The trouble seems to lie in a misconception of this field as an urban and middle class one with some elements which appear as a frill or luxury, but the reverse is true when one considers the importance of training, research and services in the vital areas of health, sanitation, nutrition, child development, shelter and clothing, home occupations, and the role of the family as the principal producing and consuming unit in this essentially rural society.

It is suggested that the Faculty of Agriculture should be structured to include rural development as a technical field and that the constituent disciplines and subject matter of the home economics curriculum should be transferred to that Faculty. This is in line with historic precedent in agricultural education and research in the United States. In association with agricultural economics, the well cultivated field of rural sociology has always encompassed the problems of rural development. Research and education in the home economic fields have been nurtured in the colleges of agriculture and in association with adult education and extension services. Home development workers in the rural development program require trained teachers in the technical fields enumerated above.

The expanded intake rate of the Faculty of Agriculture, even though reduced by subsequent dropouts, will tax existing facilities. To produce in larger numbers without sacrifice of quality, and at the same time to

expand its field research work this Faculty will require additional facilities and support.

In teacher training the U.S. contribution at Kabul University is distinctive. As it continues it may be expected to become increasingly functional in relation to development objectives. A catalytic force in this direction will be the work of the curriculum revision project and its expected emphasis on teaching materials and methods related to national goals, including agricultural and rural development. The influence of the Faculty of Education as a professional school should be extended to the entire process of teacher preparation in the University. This purpose can be served by a growing interrelationship of curricula and interchange of courses especially among the Faculties of Letters, Science, and Education. Development in this direction will enhance the prospects for a more comprehensive and integrated approach to general education.

The entire educational effort in the engineering and mechanical fields is being affected in a major way by the large scale Russian initiative, both in the University and at the related intermediate levels. The Polytechnic has admitted its first class of 240, and twelve hundred students are to be enrolled and housed in a five year program, with a potential future annual crop of nearly 200 graduates. At the beginning of this year the Faculty of Engineering had produced 114 graduates, and at the present scale may produce 35 or 40 annually, already with some signs of overproduction as related to the present small scale of the employing industrial sector. For the next five years

requirements for managerial, engineering and technical personnel at the University level were recently estimated by a Russian planning team at only 380. The linkage of the Polytechnic with the Technikums parallels the relationship of the Faculty of Engineering with the A.I.T. In both cases these intermediate schools will feed the University while at the same time providing terminal training for labor force entrants in the middle level skills. For the Technikums the Russian program may be expected to provide extensive components of work experience and work-oriented training by tying in with the industrial facilities at Jangalak, at Mazar-i-Sharif, and probably elsewhere. At the University level similar relationships will be available to the Polytechnic in conjunction with the oil and gas developments, construction, mining and other industrial activities in which the USSR is participating.

It would be desirable that the scale and direction of these activities within the University should be planned so as to insure a reasonable and effective division of labor. This may not be possible but the effort should be made. Initially the fields of concentration sponsored with U.S. and with USSR assistance appear to avoid each other, but it is understood that overlapping is expected in electrical engineering. There is certain to be divergence in the content of parallel offerings especially in the stages of pre-specialization, which may create problems of uniformity in academic standards, interchangeability, and administration. It may be hoped that the Russian moves will be coordinated with those of the U.S. in the fields of special Russian interest, if the university administration has the strength to accomplish this.

5-17-67

In this complex situation what are the best and most promising choices for the continuing U.S. program? To this observer it would seem that U.S. planning should try to avoid overcommitment in the fields entered by the USSR. What are our particular assets and unique and capabilities in the service of our defined objectives?

The United States has undisputed pre-eminence throughout the world in agricultural productivity, agricultural engineering, agricultural research and education. By comparison the Russian achievements in agriculture are undistinguished and their approach has been ill adapted for guidance and motivation of individual farmers. In the engineering and mechanical trades Russian successes have been substantial, however, and the contrast is less clear. It is in industrial management, and in the management field generally, that the U.S. achievement is outstanding. These two areas of agriculture and management coincide with what are generally identified as the greatest present weaknesses as well as critical areas of greatest urgency in Afghanistan. They also coincide with the newly accented initiatives in U.S. foreign aid.

At the University level it is suggested that agriculture and management, together with general education for development, should be the first priorities in the further development of U.S. assistance. If strengthened local training in combination with participant training can be given primacy in these fields, aimed toward high criteria of excellence and preparation for leadership, a determined effort should be made to link this training firmly to assured career prospects for the graduates and participant trainees.

5-17-67

A note is added on the meaningful relation of the Faculty of Theology to the purpose of this report. The role of religion in national development is a matter of growing general interest in developing countries, especially in the provision of enlightened leadership among the smaller communities and in rural areas. Islam shares in the common social orientation of the Judaeo/Christian/ Islamic tradition. Teachings of the Koran like those of the Bible embrace the ideals of individual integrity, self realization, mutual help, and social welfare. Mullahs are leaders in the villages and towns and teachers in many hundreds of rural communities. The University can contribute distinctively toward enlightened community leadership if the graduates of the Faculty of Theology can participate with the students of other Faculties in a growing appreciation of the values and significance of the modern scientific spirit, modern technology, and enlightened democratic national objectives, for the progress and well-being of the Afghan people.

5-17-67

VII. Initiative and Enterprise

The role of government is crucial during early stages of development in a backward country. The Royal Government of Afghanistan exercises a near monopoly of control in the affairs of the society. This control extends beyond the universally recognized fields of public administration into industry and trade, and of course throughout the entire field of education. In too many respects this control is accompanied by a lack of policy and an insufficient understanding of the needs of a comprehensive and balanced development program, as in the case of agriculture. Administrative congestion at the top and insufficient delegation of authority result in a widespread anemia of initiative at middle levels. One advisor has characterized the government as a very effective "non-government".

Yet the hand of the government is everywhere. Production and the development of infrastructure are either in the hands of government enterprises or in most cases the government has a dominant share in ownership and management of semi-private enterprise. When new enterprise becomes profitable the government is motivated to take over control.

U.S. operational assistance to Afghan development has given first emphasis to infrastructure, and or pre-investment projects and activities. Where private American management has been engaged their example has been salutory; the large operations of Morrison Knudsen have left behind them skilled workers and an image of good management. The geological, reclamation, irrigation, cadastral survey, and construction activities are illustrations. The agricultural research,

demonstration and extension activities are also preparatory, stimulative and tutorial. In these respects our efforts are designed to prepare ingredients of development rather than to launch full scale and integrated demonstrations.

Some bright spots may be found in the industrial sector. Private initiative appears to be responsive when given a chance. Illustrations are seen in the successful bus transportation system, the furniture factory and the now profitable raisin factory in Kabul, and counterparts elsewhere. Those mentioned have had foreign advisers. Various Russian-initiated operations show evidence of vitality, such as the cotton ginning plant in Mazar-i-Sharif. The somewhat helter-skelter metal-working operations at Jangalak perform varieties of useful work but the facilities are under-utilized and the management has found no mass market potential.

There is no evidence that industrial enterprises have had much difficulty in the successful training of semi-skilled workers and intermediate level craftsmen with little or no formal schooling. Surplus and inadequately utilized labor time is noted in shops which have been visited, and Afghan supervision shows little inclination to utilize slack time for orderly maintenance and cleanliness in the plant. Some plants train beyond their requirements but this is not a general policy.

Among the difficulties in developing private enterprise are the limited capabilities of indigenous management for making well-timed and properly synchronized decisions, and the extraneous influence

exercised by the government in ways which affect for example the direction, scale and pricing of exports or the importation of tools and equipment. Failure to utilize an expensive facility built with foreign assistance is illustrated by the idleness of the canning plant at Kandahar (though it is said to be salvagable). The well-operated German woollen mill in Kabul is in difficulty due to the drastic curtailment of government purchases for the army in favor of imports at favorable rates of exchange, for reasons which are open to surmise.

A new and creative approach to the stimulation of efficient private enterprise would be to find ways for government to permit or actually assist in the launching of new industries and business with foreign cooperation and foreign capital or subsidy, with the intention that such operations when fully successful would be weaned and turned over to Afghan private control when indigenous management has acquired necessary experience and demonstrated capability.

Quite probably what is most needed is successful demonstration of full-scale major integrated operations which will actually work, product satisfactory and expanding returns, and provide for training on a considerable scale as a byproduct of their operations, ultimately to be turned over as going enterprises. This would push development assistance beyond the realm of theory and persuasion into the area of operational experience and results, and in principle could be undertaken in any field.

The difficult field of agriculture might provide a dramatic opportunity. It would be necessary for American management to assume

full responsibility for development and operation of a large area of suitable agricultural land for whatever period of time would be required to bring it to a high level of productivity. The costs of demonstration and training as an integral part of the process would require separate accounts and financing. Imported farm management would need to be protected against loss, but the costs of necessary arrangements would not be out of proportion to investments already made, as in the Helmand Valley.

Similar undertakings might be feasible in other fields such as forestry and logging. These possibilities might be attractive for consortium financing; possible participation of the UN system through the World Bank would be in line with the new initiatives of American policy. This would provide for manpower development in its most practical and creative form, perhaps in the only form which will ultimately support successful development.

It is realized that the above suggestions enter a controversial and difficult field in development theory and practice. A full scale application of capital-intensive technology runs counter to the conviction that labor-intensive methods are to be preserved if the labor force is to be employed in developing countries, and to avoid an escalation of unemployment. To the writer this contrast in approach is not a fundamental one. Where labor is cheap and available a preference for labor-intensive methods is wise for many types of work, especially for earth-moving projects such as road-building and irrigation works, and in many types of construction. Cost analysis will show many

5-17-67

illustrations of unnecessary and unwise mechanization of operations which cannot take advantage of economies of scale and which can be performed economically by the intensive utilization of labor.

But while the pace of progress may be slowed down in some fields, and should be controlled with discrimination, it will not be stopped. The war on hunger will not be won with ox-cart techniques. The pressure for greater output of food in all developing countries will liberate labor power for new employments which should be planned and timed as far as possible to absorb the labor liberated from the increasingly productive agricultural pursuits. Though backward countries cannot be immunized from technological change and the cost competition of international markets, however, the deliberate planning for the inevitable modernization should not proceed blindly. There is much room for experimentation and close analysis of comparative experience in the choice of technologies which are in harmony with the over-riding need for higher productivity.

5-17-67

VIII. Womanpower

Afghanistan is committed in policy and fundamental law to the education of women. But it may be doubted whether the full implication of this commitment has been grasped. The utilization of trained womanpower remains seriously limited by the constraints of the society. Girls can be employed outside the home only in their own communities or where there are relatives. Within their communities the occupational opportunities for women are restricted by tradition. Some progress is being made in the cities; the Kabul employment survey for 1965-66 reported total women employed at a little over 2,500, which was 250 more than was shown for a year earlier, but with only 180 in the private sector. The preponderant numbers of these employed women were in education (1109), government (419), and health (398).

Girls' lycees now parallel those for boys in the larger urban communities, and coeducation is appearing in DMA's and some special schools and community schools. A major breakthrough in education has been in the University where girls are admitted to all faculties. In the labor force women are contributing in growing numbers in teaching and in health occupations, and to some extent in office work but this movement requires strong encouragement.

The present de-emphasis on home economics at the Kabul University is evidence of the inadequate appreciation of the force exercised by women in relation to economic and social goals. The important components of this curriculum are not a compendium of social amenities but a vehicle for instruction in the elements of improved individual and family living.

5-17-67

The participation of women in the employed labor force is a useful index of social progress, but the education of women is related to national development in other equally essential ways. Much more than men, women have a dual role in life - in the home in maintaining the health and well-being of the family and rearing the young who are the future resources of the country - outside the home in occupations for which they are equipped and needed - and in projecting into the larger world the special qualities of care and concern for individual and social welfare. Whether or not they are gainfully employed, literate and educated women will be the creative home-makers, wives and mothers of tomorrow, whose children from earliest childhood will be taught what the mothers know.

The proposed manpower development board might advantageously consider the creation of a commission for the employment of women which would include leading employers, both public and private, together with representative educators concerned with women's education. In government and in industry there is a scarcity of competent office help; the government itself should take the lead in the employment of female office workers -- stenographers, typists, receptionists, file clerks, salespersons, and the like. Allowing lead time for training on the job, the U.S. missions and contract teams should foster the general objective by their example, when RGA policy will permit. A commission with sufficient stature and ability will discover many ways to promote more extensive utilization of educated and trained women.

5-17-67

IX. Manpower Planning.

Any forecast for purposes of advance planning requires a choice of time perspectives in relation to defined objectives. What decisions and what actions will be dependent upon estimates of the future? In providing development assistance to Afghanistan the U.S. as donor shares in the broad objectives of the aided country, but not completely. U.S. participation in Afghan development effort, for example, is not forever. The nation's own involvement and continuing effort to attain full and productive employment of its labor force in its own development are continuous and enduring responsibilities. USAID itself, while supporting both current and long-range Afghan planning as proposed in this report, at the same time must plan its own participation in Afghan human resource development a more restricted frame, and with a cautious eye on the influence of factors which it cannot control.

U.S. contribution to Afghan education is an unusually large fraction of total investment in a country program. It extends beyond the explicitly identified education program into the whole area of technical assistance, but the investment in formal schooling by itself is a massive one.

All investment involves risk. Investment in Afghan education is no exception. The criteria to be applied are those applicable to the country program as a whole. Justification for the investment and the risk in future planning and budgeting will be sought in anticipated payoff, and there can be no doubt that this payoff and future support will be appraised in terms of actually realized contribution and predictable future contribution to development.

5-17-67

In the opinion of the writer the AID accomplishments and the anticipated future levels and rates of development should be measured in physical and financial terms on the one hand, and in terms of productive employment and real incomes (i.e., in manpower terms) on the other. Estimates and judgments will be both qualitative and quantitative, and qualitative analysis will come first if reporting programs, statistics and projections are to be meaningful.

For education this means that the suitability and adequacy of education and training must be guaged against the qualitative requirements of existing jobs, and jobs that are expected to exist. The most basic approach to this problem is systematic follow-up and appraisal of the utilization and productivity of trained and skilled manpower under conditions of actual employment, and the study of requirements and performance on the job. Work histories should be maintained for persons at the higher occupational levels in whose skills and capabilities the government and the society have important investment. The start of effective utilization, of course, is correct placement; the longer range payoff is to be realized through continued employment, progressive advancement and increasing productivity in the occupations for which persons have been trained. The most serious wastage is the loss which occurs when trained persons are lost to the fields for which they have been prepared at great cost in time and money.

In Afghanistan the scale of employment to be predicted for the future is chiefly a matter of government decision, willingness and capacity to pay, not a matter of abstract projection of needs. With

only rudimentary statistical resources, know-how and experience, the most useful estimates at this stage will be largely qualitative in most occupational fields, while in the meantime steps are taken to prepare the means and capabilities for the statistical development and quantitative analysis which is needed.

An important need is for job descriptions to be developed within employing establishments to be used as guides for management and to supply occupational information for education, training and guidance. Job descriptions are the foundation for meaningful occupational classifications and statistical reporting of needed data on employment, earnings, labor requirements, and related occupational and labor market information. In the public service they should be prepared by each government agency. In occupational fields for which specialized training is required, they should be developed through regular contacts between the training institutions and employers. Whenever genuinely useful employment services should be established the employment service personnel should assist and participate in the development of job descriptions as guides to placement and for public information. The importance of regular follow-up of graduates by schools and by the University can hardly be overstated. The utility of a national register of high level personnel in this connection will be discussed later.

Nature and Limitations of Projections. It is desirable that a well planned program for education in any country should be based on realistic projections of current and prospective manpower requirements in the occupations and professions for which preparation is to be provided. But

this is rarely done with full satisfaction very far in advance. In a country without a structured statistical system and where national plans are hazardous even a gross estimated order of magnitude may go astray.

A quantitative approach to manpower analysis for education planning must be satisfied at the outset that the quality of the education and training that can be provided will fit the occupational needs and employment opportunities. If investment in technical assistance is involved, the education and training should fit the requirements of development projects and programs. Estimates of requirements for education and training will then start with appraisal and inventory to measure the size and quality of the current supply or stock of employed and employed manpower already possessing the skills and training which are needed.

An initial step is to establish the existing levels of employment (actual utilization) in the industries and occupations which require skilled workers. This done by means of properly designed reporting by employing establishments. Second, it is essential that the complete and maintain national register or roster of trained and skilled persons shall be comprehensive for occupations and professions in which special skills are essential for national development. In view of the limited numbers of such persons in Afghanistan this is a far more practicable project here than in many countries. The scheme should provide for regular and continuing follow-up, and evaluation of actual utilization of the investment in high level manpower which will be revealed by analysis of an up-to-date file. These steps will furnish

basic information for better control and utilization; hidden reserves of skills can be discovered if they exist, wastage can be uncovered, improved allocation can be undertaken, and reported shortages of supply can be verified.

Measurement and forecast of the effective demand for trained manpower is more difficult. A careful distinction must be made between abstract concepts of manpower needs on the one hand and realistic and supportable evidence of demand and employment opportunity on the other. Projections of future requirements are hazardous in a developing country where there is an uncertain gap between plans and their realization.

Especially in an economy dominated by the government, manpower analysis or "assessment" is not a specialized art or "mystery" which can produce magical answers without full reliance on the structure and definiteness of national planning and the annual development programs. Estimates of manpower requirements should utilize whatever industry-by-industry and profession-by-profession forecasts can be developed, but development schemes can rarely quantify the scale of future requirements with occupational detail for a full five year period in advance with much reliability. For service fields such as health and teaching forecasts will be as firm as the budgetary commitments of the national plan, and no more so. Account should be taken of planned and committed major projects and programs and their anticipated rates of expansion or phasing, with approximate staffing patterns to be supplied by the planners. Manning tables as models for selected industries in other countries can be obtained though they must be used with caution. Overall

requirements for large occupational groups however cannot be based solely, or perhaps even primarily, on such estimates, for reliance must also be placed on the more abstractly-based judgments of expected growth rates and trends in the economy, and government financing.

The record of manpower forecasts is not altogether impressive. This view is supported by an AID research report which has just come to hand. An evaluative study of manpower survey experience is in an early and tentative stage but of course no conclusions have been reached. Aggregative estimates tend to understate future demand for various skills when the pace of technological innovation and improvement is not foreseen. When fixed coefficients are applied to staffing patterns for particular occupations (as is often done for engineers) the graduates of training programs may thwart the planners by not entering the occupations for which they were trained.

As indicated in Section Two of this report, manpower estimates to guide university programs will be differently based for different fields. Requirements in some areas are completely dependent on administrative decisions and the financial capability of the government, and on the firmness of plans and budgets. Surveys and appraisals of needs may help in setting targets for development, but needs may differ widely from absorptive capability and firm prospects for employment.

In specialized fields such as engineering and the machancial trades it is suggested that the Faculty of Engineering and other training institutions undertake systematic contact with employing

institutions to determine and verify their current and potential needs and capacity for employment of additional trained workers, This direct contact will uncover opportunities for utilization of engineers, for example, which will not have been visualized by employers. It will also show up cases of mis-assignment and under-utilization. This procedure will introduce employers to the problem of realistic forecasting, the importance of allowing lead time for the preparation of new workers in specialized fields, and develop the best foundation for meaningful educational planning. This approach has precedent among professional schools and its feasibility should be considered in the principal fields of special training.

The numbers of medical and health personnel who when trained will be employed is a matter of institutional planning and finance. Manpower for health services is not a principal subject of this report, but a few comments should be made.

All manpower planning is based on the assumption of scarcity. There is no doubt that the people of Afghanistan want (and need) more health services than they can get. Planning also confronts the need for priority allocations. Some reasonable criteria need to be applied to determine which needs are most important and which will go unsatisfied. Manpower is the most costly of the health services, labor intensive to a high degree, and it should be used economically.

Trained physicians and surgeons to be used efficiently, must be supported with hospitals, clinics and other facilities and, perhaps more important, they require the backstopping of "para-medical" personnel -- nurses, technicians and others who can perform necessary

duties which need not be performed by doctors themselves. A sufficient supply of these middle level health skills relieves the stringency of physician scarcity and makes possible a more flexible and widely distributed system of public health. To attract and train an increased supply of women nurses is of special importance.

The Ministry of Planning reports that the number of doctors or physicians increased from 293 to 450 during the Second Plan period; most of these are in Kabul. The number of other skilled health workers increased from 866 to 1861 in the same period. Any probable rate of increase from this base will still leave the vast majority of the people almost utterly without access to medical care. Largely for this reason it must be concluded that the rate of population growth will not be rapidly stimulated in the near future by a falling death rate. By the same token interest in family planning is not yet stimulated by an overtly disturbing "population explosion". However, for this very reason an appropriate emphasis in medical education on methods of birth control may be especially rewarding, exercising some early dampening effect and preparing a public response for the future.

Reference is made elsewhere to the great value for public health of essential training for teachers in the fundamentals of sanitation, hygiene and nutrition, and the practical instillation of these principles through all levels of the education system and especially in rural schools. An awareness of these principles on the part of employing establishments is equally important in control of working conditions on the job.

5-17-67

A special problems for forecasters is created by the multiplicity and decentralization of initiatives among the sources of assistance to education, and the limited capacity within the government for central coordination and the exercise of balanced control of commitments. Though the U.S. is an important and large scale participant it is far from being a controlling partner in the total education enterprise. In this special circumstance, as pointed out elsewhere, we should lead where we have greatest special strength, in areas of high priority, and try to minimize risks and avoid or cut potential losses where we can identify them. In particular we should concentrate on quality and avoid overextension of scale in areas entered by the mounting Russian initiative in technical education.

In summary, manpower forecasts to be useful must appraise the prospects for actual productive employment, not abstract need, and must consider both the scale and the quality of the training effort in relation to these prospects. To build the statistical foundations and institutional capabilities for current manpower analysis and planning is a task which itself will require extensive preparation, technical training, and development of the necessary institutions.

5-17-67

X. A Human Resources Development Program

An explicit and high level authority is needed in Afghanistan to assume responsibilities for a broad program for human resources development planning, the efficient allocation of trained manpower to meet development needs, and promote effective utilization and coordination of manpower programs on a government-wide basis.

Background and Present Resources. Action to establish a capability for manpower assessment and planning in the Ministry of Planning was taken several years ago, during the early stages of Second Five Year Plan preparation, but adequate support for this initiative has not been provided. Now, in 1967, a commission on manpower is newly proposed by the Cabinet, to consist of the Deputy Ministers of Education, Planning, and other involved Ministries, reportedly to be concerned with evaluation and estimation of manpower needed in the Third Five Year Plan, the supply of needed professional persons, educational levels in vocational and specialized education, the expeditious assignment of such personnel and their absorption in the country's development program (according to informal notes on reported Cabinet decision of about 16 January 1967).

UNESCO documents on educational development have stated that a "National Manpower Development Board" will have to be created (preferably within the Ministry of Planning) to be responsible for manpower and the development of human resources with special reference to statistics and manpower and employment forecasts, for on-the-job training schemes, salary and other incentive policy and related functions. An Advisory

Commission for Technical Education is also proposed. A Management Improvement Institute is under consideration by the Cabinet, which would be set up in the Prime Minister's office.

Advisory services in labor and manpower have been supplied by the ILO for a number of years. A competent manpower analyst and demographer is a member of the USSR team of advisers working with the Ministry of Planning; The overall manpower estimates and projections prepared by this adviser are accepted as the best available by the Ministry of Planning (and by the Nathan Team). Meagre sources used for these estimates utilize United Nations and ILO data in combination with Afghan sources and comparisons with data for similar stages of development in the neighboring areas of Russia.

Intensive work on estimates of educational requirements has been done by the UNESCO Planning Team working with the Ministry of Education. UNESCO has been engaged in a long series of education surveys dating back to 1952. Their projections of education requirements prepared in 1966 are in great detail, presenting models based on standard demographic and actuarial methods and cohort analysis in relation to the successive stages of education and adjusted to economic trends. In effect these models are recommendations, based on estimated needs, and their final relationship to actual appropriations and implementation is conjectural. Also they are constructed without objective demographic data, and they are adjusted to statistical projections of economic trends which again may be unrealistic in relation to actual implementation of economic trends. If education in Afghanistan is to be planned to fit a more or

less abstract pattern of abstract needs it would be unproductive at present to spend time at present on further elaborate estimates.

At present in Afghanistan there is no systematic program or central organization in the human resources/manpower field and there is no effectively organized central statistcal office.

Some rudimentary components for a manpower program are in existence, however. Among existing ingredients are:

1) A Manpower Directorate in the Ministry of Planning with functions relating to "manpower and demography" within a Directorate of Statistics. This unit collects information on employment and anticipated labor requirements at annual intervals by the circulation of a questionnaire among industrial establishments in Kabul. One-time surveys in other cities (1962-63) have not been repeated. Without personal visits by trained staff much of the information gleaned through these inquiries is of limited value and forecasts are unlikely to be useful. Establishments are not visited in the collection of the date.

This unit also exercises formal responsibility for the allocation of trained personnel (in principle, all graduates of the University, all persons returned from overseas training, etc.) to posts within the government. The unit lacks facilities, prestige and authority for continuing, creative and effective surveillance of manpower utilization. Manpower allocations cleared and validated through this office have official and compulsive sanction, but there is no evidence that these powers are matched by needed informational resources, and capability for critical analysis and independent judgment which this difficult task

5/17/67

requires. The unit's organizational position as a sub-arm of a statistics section conveys an impression of a limited manpower role. The proper functions of a manpower development unit are not limited to statistics for planning. (A former chief of this unit participated in the AID-sponsored International Manpower Seminar in Washington in 1965.)

2) A Civil Service Department in the Prime Ministry is assigned the usual important functions of such an office; these need not be described here.

3) A "National Employment Bureau" is included within a "department of labor" in the Ministry of Mines and Industries.

This bureau was established in 1962. It has had the benefit of ILO assistance. It now is languishing. Originally staffed by 12 officials, it now includes only two officials and has been moved into the personnel department of the Ministry. It claims to have registered between three and four thousand applicants annually since its establishment. A few hundred placements are reported for each year. The small scale of its activities are revealed by the limited information at hand. There were 1500 reported placements in gas pipeline construction at Mazar-i-Sharif in 1966 but there is no office at that location and the employing establishment there has a known competence to handle its own recruitment. Employers do not call on the service and persons referred do not report back. The present operation appears to be largely meaningless and has little support, though the person in charge has just returned from an AID-sponsored study trip to India.

5-17-67

4) A National Register of Skilled Personnel has been initiated by the Civil Service Department. Cards have been issued to be completed for government departments by personnel with specialized skills and training. These cards are being prepared for some groups (e.g., the Ministry of Planning and the faculties of the University) but the completion of the register is lagging. Responsibility for extending the Register on a comprehensive national basis should be a practicable undertaking but a central responsibility for maintaining and utilizing it does not seem to be clearly defined.

5) A Division of Vocational Guidance was set up in March 1967 within the Department of Vocational Education in the Ministry of Education. Like the employment bureau mentioned above it consists of a director who also has other dutiesand one other official; these are the only persons engaged in this activity. There is no formalized cooperation between this division and the labor, with planning authorities or representatives of employees, or with any regular placement service. Responsibility for placing of graduates of vocational schools now rests with the Ministry of Planning. There is an advisory committee but its functions have not been specified. The division has the services of an ILO adviser, UNESCO has shown an interest in this activity as a bridge between education and employment, but the present resource can only be described as a token effort.

The annual survey of employment in Kabul, conducted by the Directorate of Manpower of the Ministry of Planning, is now in its tenth round. Forms are distributed to respondents without instructions

5/17/67

and are prepared without supervision. Variations in non-response and uncertain estimates for some categories by the municipality make annual comparisons more or less meaningless. Instructions and definitions of terms are not supplied and job titles are not defined. One-time surveys of similar character have been made in other cities. It is desirable that this essential establishment survey should be tightened up and improved, and when this is done it should be extended to other municipalities and to all major non-agricultural establishments.

The predominance of government in the urban labor market is indicated by the recent results for Kabul. Subject to many errors, this survey for 1965-66 shows more than 32,500 employed in the public sector as compared with a few more than 22,000 in the private sector. In the latter, more employment was found in small shops than in the large establishments. Vacancy reports are of doubtful meaning and occupational classification too crude to be helpful; the largest numbers were for clerks and teachers, which is suggestive of the sluggish rate of labor market entry for women in these occupations.

The first national census ever to be taken in Afghanistan is projected for 1968-69. Advisory services are supplied by a UNTAB [redacted] expert. A preliminary census in Kabul has provided trial experience; results are being tabulated in New Delhi. Organization of a first census is always difficult. Results will show the geographic distribution of the population and the labor force with standard details on age, sex, family composition and the like. The census will supply

5-17-67

benchmarks for future comparisons but without nationally representative surveys no trends can be determined until a second census is taken. Information on employment and unemployment should be meaningful for the cities. Occupational detail will be of great interest; however, no occupational guides will be used by the enumerators and meaningful classification will be hampered by the inexactness of unstructured job terminology. For the longer future, of course, reliable censuses will be of inestimable value in measuring broad demographic and labor force aggregates and trends.

A few scattered small scale surveys of villages and selected localities have been made by the Ministry of Planning and other agencies, including the Faculties of Agriculture and Education at Kabul University. These surveys supply interesting bits of information (including indications of occupational and economic activity in several village and rural areas), but sample survey technique is largely unknown in Afghanistan.

A National Manpower Development Board: Structure and Functions.

Various criteria of effecfiveness for the proposed Manpower Development Board are implicit in the general discussion in this report. Specific functions are outlined in the following paragraphs.

The Cabinet should invest the Board with full responsibility for a broad national program for human resources development and utilization. The Board should represent all principal agencies with important manpower functions. Essential for its effectiveness will be the ranking participation of the Ministries of Planning, Education, Mines and

Industries, Agriculture, Defense, Public Works, Interior, and the Civil Service . A competent and efficient directorate will be required to be headed by an officer who can command respect at highest levels in the Government with the support of a well trained staff. Cabinet-level participation would provide capability for authoritative action to implement Board decisions with necessary action to provide needed information and to implement policy decisions.

The Board should set up a Central Training Authority or Commission to develop and implement a general program for in-service and on-the-job training, in coordination with education authorities and representatives of employing organizations.

The Board should create a Council for Advanced Training which would plan and coordinate all programs for foreign participant training. The President of the Kabul University should be a member of this Council, and representatives of aid-giving agencies offering such training should sit with the Council in liaison and advisory capacity. Such a Council was proposed by a UNESCO adviser.

The Board should define the appropriate functions of the National Employment Bureau which, when and if properly staffed, should give first emphasis to the development of meaningful occupational information through regular field visits to employing establishments. (This is obviously impossible with its present strength.)

The Board should take steps to provide meaningful cooperation and support for a vocational guidance effort, or this program should

5-17-67

be suspended until conditions are propitious.

The Board should control and adjust the plans and commitments for terminal education programs at intermediate levels in relation to best judgment of requirements for higher training.

The Board's directorate should design and recommend the general scope and content of a program of manpower statistics in consultation with the Ministry of Planning. This program should be carried out with an appropriate division of labor to be developed by the Ministry of Planning, with the advice of international experts. (Excellent manuals to guide this development and its adaptation to a given country have been prepared by the United Nations and its specialized agencies, and by the US Department of Labor for AID.)

The Board should take necessary action to establish the National Register of High Level Personnel on a continuing and comprehensive basis, to maintain and analyze it currently, and take steps to correct the underutilization of the nation's resources of skills and training. (A new guide which describes in detail the steps and procedures for an inventory of high level and skilled manpower is obtainable from the US Bureau of Labor Statistics through AID/Washington.)

The Board should give special attention to development and utilization in the civilian labor force of manpower training and work experience supplied by the army during periods of national service. The armed forces literacy and vocational programs of other countries should be examined.

The Board should advise with the Ministries of Public Works and

Agriculture and with Provincial Governors in devising and implementing plans to utilize surplus labor and alleviate unemployment in projects useful for rural development and urban improvement.

The Board should initiate and sponsor or conduct studies of wages and salaries in public and private sector in relation to incentives, stimulation of productivity, and productive utilization of manpower.

The Board should foster and participate in programs for management improvement.

The Board should consider the creation of a commission for the employment of women which would include leading employers, public and private, together with representative educators and others in a position to promote the training and productive utilization of womanpower in the nation's development.

These suggested functions are illustrative and would be amplified and extended by the Board itself if it is established.

5-17-67

XI. The Labor Market, Occupations, and the Wage Structure

The country's employed labor force contributes to national development only as it is motivated to full endeavor. In the non-agricultural sectors this motivation is closely tied to the relevance of the wage and salary structure to performance and productivity and to the relative degree of importance assigned to different occupations and positions in this structure.

The over-riding role of status, personal and family connections has a profound influence over the allocation of jobs and position among the educated and the elite in Afghan society. Higher education is still largely a prerogative of the elite. When position and compensation are determined in the main without direct relationship to performance and productivity, labor resources are sure to be misallocated.

The government has a prior claim on trained manpower since it has paid the full costs of educational stipends to students. As a result, new and recent entrants in the labor market from middle or upper schools have little or no freedom of choice in seeking employment. Under the formal pattern the private sector cannot easily bargain directly for them unless they have been able to refund the costs of education, which has been done only in rare cases. These circumstances cannot but discourage or stifle initiative on the part of new workers and support the rigidities of the status-oriented system. The preponderant role of government in the labor market assigns to public employment a controlling influence in determining the prevailing terms and conditions of employment generally.

5-17-67

Existing civil service regulations, with few exceptions, furnish little incentive for improvement in skills. Promotion is based on seniority; the employee who demonstrates willingness to take on added responsibilities often is at a disadvantage in comparison with others who accept the status quo. This is less a matter of remuneration than a matter of the prevailing attitudes.

The need for wage reform is obvious even to the casual observer. Efficient allocation of labor cannot be attained when wage structures are distorted, and proper placements do not occur automatically when the ordinary operations of labor market forces are smothered by authoritarian influences. The Russian manpower adviser at the Ministry of Planning has observed that "the system of paying to encourage the workers involves undisciplined trends and does not help in better application of workers or increase in production", and he advises that "it would be better to pay according to time and rewarding systems which do not need elaborate procedures and (would be) easily grasped ... It is also necessary to fix regulations for overtime, work competitions, reward .... and work rules for the workers" (rough translation).

Research is needed to determine just how workers find jobs, explore the relationship of education to employment and advancement, trace examples of misallocation as well as proper placement, and discover what factors other than training, suitability and competence have significant or controlling influence on jobs and careers. When

work histories are accumulated through efficient operation of a national register, and through effective follow-up work by educational institutions which has been suggested, it may become possible to analyze the workings of the labor market in Afghanistan. A major contribution can be made by close and critical study of the utilization of AID's 1600 participant trainees. This should be undertaken by the Mission.

It is understood that an A.I.D. summer research project is soon to engage in a study of wages in Afghanistan. It would be useful if this project should undertake a full description of the existing pattern of wages and salaries insofar as this can be done within the time allotted. The formal grades and steps established by the government are the dominating influence. A classification of the actual occupations found in these several grades would be useful if it could be compiled. It is likely that the distribution of employees within the structure reflects seniority in the main (and probably less objective factors as well) rather than clear cut occupational distinctions, or length and intensity of training. Frequency distributions according to wage class and grade might be compared among RGA ministries if the data are readily available. The wage pattern in a few selected government and private enterprises should be checked to see whether incentive variations in pay exist and whether production or productivity factors enter at all. A crying need for job descriptions is stressed by public administration advisers.

5-17-67

The summer project might also design a proposal for an intensive study of wages and earnings and appraise the possible utility of a comprehensive salary and wage survey if the Government (presumably the Ministry of Planning) would sponsor such a project. The establishment of a capability for the necessary job analysis, measurement of work performance and wage evaluation would be a longer range objective.

It might be particularly rewarding to study groups of key industrial occupations which are "skill-generative" within industries which are strategic for economic growth, seeking also for "job families" (clusters of related skill components) whose common denominators should be refledted in wage comparabilities. Identification of such "families" would also be useful in the definition of educational requirements for specific skills.

A study of earnings and occupations in petty trade and in traditional occupations would throw light into a little known area. Anyone looking closely at work performed in the bazaars must be impressed with the high degree of skill which is exhibited. The skilled workers in traditional occupations are an important part of the labor force. Some mechanical school graduates find their way into the bazaars. Youths "apprenticed" in these trades may be found to possess convertable skills, and study of these crafts may also lead to new ideas for expansion of small industries.

5-17-67

Whether extra money incomes are traceable to additional increments of education is an interesting problem, one facet of which is the further question of the relevance of additional education to actual performance. The prevalence of "moonlighting" as a palliative for depressed levels of earnings might be awakward to determine in Afghan communities but it is doubtless found among government workers. The effect of wages paid by foreigners might also repay investigation.

The offering of competitive prizes for competent graduate research projects in the occupational and employment field would be an interesting possibility to be considered by AID.

5-17-67